

# MINUTES

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### July 13, 2022

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held in hybrid format in person at City Council Chambers, 31 East 5th Street, Tempe, AZ, and virtually through WebEx.

#### Regular Meeting 6:02 PM

##### **Present:**

##### **Staff:**

Kyle Woodson	Jeff Tamulevich, Director - Planning
Dave Fackler	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Chris Garraty	Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer
Elizabeth Gilbert	Joanna Barry, Administrative Assistant II, Com Dev
Laurene Montero	
Kiyomi Kurooka	
Reylynne Williams	
Gregory Larson	
Brenda Abney, ex officio member	

- 1) **Call to Audience:** Persons wishing to address the Commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair. However, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits Commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

No members of the public were present.

- 2) **Voting of the Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner Williams noted that on page 2, at the top of the motion, there is double wording: "to approve the approved." Chair Woodson noted that on page 3, 6 lines down, in the sentence starting with "Woodson noted the criterion 'deed,'" it should just be the letter "D."

**Motion** by Vice Chair Fackler to approve the amended Meeting Minutes of June 8, 2022; second by Commissioner Larson. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Laurene Montero, Reylynne Williams, and Gregory Larson

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Jim Garrison

- 3) **Approval of Agenda**

Chair Woodson asked if any Commissioner would like to change the order of the agenda.

**Motion** by Vice Chair Fackler to approve the July 13, 2022, agenda; second by Commissioner Larson. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, and Reylynne Williams

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Jim Garrison

**4) Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of gates across the alcoves on the Tempe (Old Mill Avenue) Bridge, located at 1 South Mill Avenue (PL220179/HPO220006). The applicant is the Tempe Homeless Solutions Task Force.**

Presentation by Paul Bentley, Human Services Director, Isaac Chavira, Transportation Maintenance Manager, and Commander Kim Hale from the Tempe Police Department.

The Tempe Homeless Solutions Task Force was asked to seek options to address the trash, graffiti, and needs resulting from the presence of the unhoused in the alcoves on the Tempe Bridge. Maintenance of these areas is very staff intensive. Power washing may eventually damage the bridge materials. The Homeless Solutions Task Force seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness to install gates across the pedestrian rest bays as a permanent solution. Intention is to provide some type of barrier to prevent individuals from vandalizing and entering the areas and to provide for safety and health. Cost is approximately \$28,000. Funds have been identified. Gates could be installed by the end of the year, pending approval.

Commissioner Montero asked how long the issue has been going with people experiencing homelessness to the extent that is being stated in the presentation.

Mr. Bentley stated that the issue has been with us for a very long time. Increasing year to year. He said Tempe has on average 390-400 people on any given day experiencing homelessness. 35% increase from last year in Maricopa County.

Commissioner Montero asked for a plan on the gates. Will they be able to be open during the day? Will they be closed at night? Open during the day?

Mr. Bentley stated there are no specifics on exactly what time the gates will open. (Example open at 5 am, close at 6 pm.) Will look for input on what time gates should be open.

Commissioner Larson asked about the locking mechanism when the gates are closed. Is it going to be a padlock or deadbolt?

Mr. Chavira stated the City of Tempe uses a standard lock that most transportation and park employees can open.

Commissioner Larson asked, if the gate is open, is there a way to lock it open?

Mr. Chavira stated that with their current standard practices, if a gate is open it must be locked in an open position and if closed it will be locked in a closed position.

Commissioner Kurooka stated that some locations have played classical music to keep people from hanging out. Have you considered doing something like that?

Commander Hale stated there have been times they have used classical music on Mill Ave to discourage people from different activities. It has not been as effective as they would like it to be. The bridge is not wired for sound at this time.

Commissioner Kurooka asked about the higher lighting level. Will that not work either?

Commander Hale stated they have brought out portable light towers to Mill Ave. It has not been effective.

Commissioner Kurooka also brought up the possibility of using something with less visual impact than the gates (example: tempered glass or transparent material).

Mr. Bentley stated he will welcome all forms of input on other types of material to use instead of the gates. Vice Chair Fackler stated he has an issue with the damage the gates could cause to the structure. He said he does not want people driving down the bridge looking at the gates. What is most concerning is the attachments. Could someone climb over the gate? He would like to see additional options studied. Would the gates swing out? Sidewalk is only 3 feet wide.

Mr. Chavira stated that they will use 3-inch anchors. 3/8-inch diameter into the structure. The gates will be designed to be secure, and the gates will open completely and can be locked in position.

[Vice Chair Fackler's comment was inaudible]

Mr. Chavira stated they will identify an expertise in concrete. Possibly another alternative would be to use the sidewalk and not the alcove.

Chair Woodson asked if it's feasible to get a gate in there with no gap at the top that allows someone to climb over it.

Mr. Chavira stated that the gate will be high enough that it will prevent someone from jumping over.

Chair Woodson asked how many alcoves are there? Are they all on the southbound lanes? Are there issues with all the alcoves?

Mr. Chavira stated that there are 8 alcoves, and they are all located on the southbound lanes. All bridges in the city are maintained on a quarterly basis. Over the last 6 months cleaning has taken place on a weekly basis on Saturday. Cleaning trash daily. All 8 have had to be monitored for trash, graffiti and/or encampments. Graffiti is being address in all alcoves. Some graffiti can be removed and some has to be painted over. Some items found in the alcoves have had to be removed by a vendor due to safety and hazard for City staff.

Chair Woodson asked how the problem with the alcoves is being tracked.

Mr. Bentley stated that in their area they receive input from the community and staff, as well as community complaints, resulting in enhanced outreach in the area.

Mr. Chavira stated that he has had to increase efforts to clean the areas. Used to be done on a quarterly basis, then monthly, and now daily. Their emergency vehicle patrols the alcoves daily to clean up trash.

Chair Woodson asked if this is the primary option to be used.

Mr. Bentley stated they are implementing many different options to help provide assistance. . . [inaudible]

Commissioner Montero stated that Commissioner Kurooka had some ideas with the lighting and music that would be much less intrusive on the bridge.

Chair Woodson asked Dr. Lechner to provide perspective on the issue.

Dr. Lechner stated that it is unclear what impact by drilling into a nearly 100-year-old structure would have. Installing gates would change the appearance of the bridge. Dr. Lechner understands the City's desire to have a permanent solution to the problem. There is always going to be a risk involved when suggesting something like this. Something to consider is the issue of will the gates ever be removed. Could the holes be patched? In the Historic Preservation Office, Dr. Lechner said, he periodically monitors the various historic buildings owned by the City. All the structures are havens for the unhoused population in Tempe. If there is a way to get around access barriers, the unhoused population will find it. As noted in the suggested conditions of approval, if the Commissioners want to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, we want to make sure if the drilling does occur, and the gates are removed, the holes can be a patched and will not damage the integrity of the structure. If the Commissioners do not want to approve the plan as is, the Certificate of Appropriateness can be denied for

the specific gate design and the Homeless Solutions Task Force can go back to the drawing board and try to incorporate the feedback given tonight. A denial of this plan does not mean a denial of any plan. Dr. Lechner noted the suggested conditions of approval in his staff report.

Chair Woodson asked, if the gates were installed and actually worked, do you see a major change in costs? Will it make a difference? Someone will need to open and close the gates daily.

Mr. Chavira stated that with the gates, there will be less trash left behind and less graffiti in the alcoves. They will go back to the original schedule for the bridge cleaning on a quarterly or monthly basis. Efforts will be made elsewhere than the bridge.

Mr. Abrahamson stated that lighting should be looked into more. At least on a trial basis. Light can be a deterrent.

Mr. Chavira stated that if they added lighting to the existing structure, they will still need to find a way to attach it. Lighting systems can be damaged easily.

Commissioner Larson stated that he is balancing between the bridge being pressure washed daily versus the drilling that will take place when the gates are installed. Would like to request a return to the table with a more cost-benefit analysis plan to protecting the bridge.

Chair Woodson asked Commissioner Larson if he is suggesting to table with the additional request? Commissioner Larson stated yes. Chair Woodson asked for a motion to table with the additional request for a more detailed proposal to address the concerns brought up by Commissioners.

Mr. Bentley requested clarity on the Commissioners' additional requests. He wanted to know if the Commissioners were looking for additional information about the possible harm that the attachment might do to the historic structure.

Chair Woodson suggested possibly getting detailed information from a specialist that could give information on how the attachments will or will not cause damage to the structure.

Vice Chair Fackler stated that yes more clarity is needed on what the attachment can do to the structure. He suggested possibly using a prop to determine that the gate cannot be ripped off the wall. The attachments need to present themselves as a permanent option.

**Motion** by Commissioner Larson to table [continue] PL220179/HPO220006; second by Vice Chair Fackler. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, and Reyllynne Williams.

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Jim Garrison

## 5) Update on recent graffiti remediation at the Hayden Flour Mill Complex

Dr. Lechner presented an update on graffiti remediation efforts at the Hayden Flour Mill Complex (including 1951 Silos). In 2021, the City contracted with Logan Simpson for graffiti removal measures. Historic Preservation Officer is satisfied with Logan Simpson and the graffiti cleaning. Two chemicals were used to remove the graffiti that were not damaging. HPO denied Logan Simpson's offer to apply Si-Coat, which deters the graffiti from staying on the building, due to its sheen.

Chair Woodson asked for some additional photography following the phase of work. Is this something that will be done periodically if there are reports of more graffiti?

Dr. Lechner stated he will ask Logan Simpson for additional photos. If Logan Simpson can get the photos to Dr. Lechner, he will pass them along to the Commissioners. Yes, the North and West side have already been tagged with more graffiti. Further remediation will be done on an as-needed basis.

Commissioner Garraty stated that Logan Simpson did not get as many post-treatment photos. The graffiti is going up faster than the photos could be taken.

Chair Woodson asked for the drone footage.

Commissioner Garraty said he will look for better individual shots from the drone images.

## 6) Chair / Staff Updates

Chair Woodson asked Dr. Lechner to introduce Ms. Brenda Abney.

Dr. Lechner introduced Ms. Abney. She is the Manager of the Tempe History Museum, which oversees some historic houses in Tempe. She is also *ex-officio* member of the HPC, per the Tempe Historic Preservation Code.

Dr. Lechner stated that last month, at its June 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting, City Council unanimously adopted the updated Historic Preservation Plan as well as the two inventories of historical resources that HPC recommended for approval at its May 2022 meeting.

## 7) Current Events/ Announcements / Future Agenda Items

### Member Announcements

### Staff Announcements

Vice Chair Fackler stated that the first meeting of Technical Advisory Group for the General Plan 2050 will be Tuesday 7/19/22. Meetings are twice a month: 1st and 3rd Tuesdays of the month. Meetings continue until October 2023.

Dr. Lechner stated that at the next HPC meeting in August, there will be 2 agenda items. 1st is the Butler Gray House at 1220 S. Mill Ave. City Council approved a 5-year conservation easement agreement and lot split for the back of the property. A Zoning Map amendment will also have to be approved by Council. HPC will determine whether to recommend approval. Main August HPC meeting agenda item is the neighborhood meeting to regarding Zoning Map amendment related to request to designate Guadalupe Cemetery in Tempe Historic Property Register.

**Motion** by Vice Chair Fackler to adjourn; second by Commissioner Montero. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Gregory Larson, Kiyomi Kurooka, Laurene Montero, and Reyllynne Williams

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Jim Garrison

Hearing adjourned at 7:36 pm.

Prepared by: Jennifer Daniels, Administrative Assistant

Reviewed by: Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer